## COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

RECEIVED

### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

SEP 0 2 2009

In the Matter of:

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

APPLICATION OF KENTUCKY UTILITIES	S )
COMPANY FOR CERTIFICATES OF	)
PUBLIC CONVENIENCE AND NECESSITY	) CASE NO. 2009-00197
AND APPROVAL OF ITS 2009 COMPLIANO	CE)
PLAN FOR RECOVERY BY	)
ENVIRONMENTAL SURCHARGE	)

# PETITION OF KENTUCKY UTILITIES COMPANY FOR CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTION

Kentucky Utilities Company ("KU"), pursuant to 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7, respectfully petitions the Commission to classify as confidential and protect from public disclosure certain information provided by KU in response to Question No. 24 of the Initial Data Request of Commission Staff, dated August 19, 2009. KU requests confidential treatment of information contained in several documents that collectively represent KU's analysis of proposals sent to KU concerning the projects contain in KU's Application in this proceeding, as well as KU's award recommendations for the projects ("Confidential Information"). In support of this Motion, KU notes that the Commission treated similar coal bid analysis information as confidential in two of KU's most recent two-year and six-month fuel adjustment clause review proceedings. (See Letter from Executive Director Jeff Derouen re KU Petition for Confidential Protection, Case No. 2008-00520 (March 20, 2009); Letter from Executive Director Stephanie Stumbo re KU Petition for Confidential Protection, Case No. 2008-00285 (October 20, 2008); Letter from Executive Director Beth O'Donnell re KU Petition for Confidential Protection, Case No. 2007-00524 (February 27, 2008); collectively attached hereto as Attachment 1.)

In further support of this Motion, KU states as follows:

- 1. Under the Kentucky Open Records Act, the Commission is entitled to withhold from public disclosure information confidentially disclosed to it to the extent that open disclosure would permit an unfair commercial advantage to competitors of the entity disclosing the information to the Commission. *See* KRS 61.878(1)(c). Public disclosure of the information identified herein would, in fact, prompt such a result for the reasons set forth below.
- 2. Disclosure of the factors underlying KU's proposal analysis and selection process concerning environmental compliance projects would damage KU's competitive position and business interests. This information reveals the business model the Company uses—the procedure it follows and the factors and inputs it considers—in evaluating proposals for some of the most important and costly projects in which KU engages. If the Commission grants public access to the information requested in Question No. 24, potential respondents to KU's requests for proposals could manipulate the proposal solicitation process to the detriment of KU and its customers by tailoring proposals to correspond to, and to comport with, KU's confidential internal evaluation criteria and process. As noted above, the Commission has treated such information as confidential in the past. (See Attachment 1.)
- 3. The information for which KU is seeking confidential treatment is not known outside of KU, is not disseminated within KU except to those employees with a legitimate business need to know and act upon the information, and is generally recognized as confidential and proprietary information in the energy industry.
- 4. KU does not object to limited disclosure of the confidential information described herein, pursuant to an acceptable protective agreement, to intervenors with legitimate interests in reviewing the same for the purpose of participating in this case.

5. In accordance with the provisions of 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7, KU is filing with the Commission one copy of the Confidential Information highlighted and ten (10) copies without the Confidential Information.

WHEREFORE, Kentucky Utilities Company respectfully requests that the Commission grant confidential protection to the information designated as confidential for a period of five years from the date of filing the same.

Dated: September 2, 2009

Respectfully submitted,

Kendrick R. Riggs

W. Duncan Crosby III

Stoll Keenon Ogden PLLC

2000 PNC Plaza

500 West Jefferson Street

Louisville, Kentucky 40202-2828

Telephone: (502) 333-6000

Allyson K. Sturgeon

Senior Corporate Counsel

E.ON U.S. LLC

220 West Main Street

Louisville, Kentucky 40202

Telephone: (502) 627-2088

Counsel for Kentucky Utilities Company

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing Petition for Confidential Protection was served via U.S. mail, first-class, postage prepaid, this 2nd day of September 2009, upon the following persons:

Michael L. Kurtz Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Counsel for Kentucky Utilities Company





Steven L. Beshear Governor

Leonard K. Peters Secretary Energy and Environment Cabinet Commonwealth of Kentucky
Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd
P O. Box 615
Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615
Telephone (502) 564-3940

Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky gov

March 20, 2009

David L. Armstrong Chairman

James W. Gardner Vice Chairman

> John W. Clay Commissioner

Hon. Allyson K. Sturgeon E.ON U.S. LLC 220 West Main Street P.O. Box 32010 Louisville, Kentucky 40232

Re: Kentucky Utilities Company - Petition for Confidential Treatment received

February 11, 2009 - PSC Reference - Case No. 2008-00520

Dear Ms. Sturgeon:

The Public Service Commission has received the Motion for Confidential Treatment you filed on February 11, 2009 on behalf of Kentucky Utilities Company to protect certain information filed with the Commission as confidential under Section 7 of 807 KAR 5:001 and KRS 61.870 et. seq. The information you seek to have treated as confidential is identified as certain information contained in Kentucky Utilities Company's Responses to Data Request Nos. 6, 9 and 24 of the Commission's Order Appendix B dated January 23, 2009, and more particularly described as (No. 6) forecasted sales revenues; (No. 9) planned maintenance schedules; and (No. 24) bid analysis information.

Based on a review of the information and pursuant to KRS 61.878 and 807 KAR 5:001, section 7, the Commission has determined that the information you seek to keep confidential is of a proprietary nature, which if publicly disclosed would permit an unfair commercial advantage to your client's competitors. Therefore, the information requested to be treated as confidential meets the criteria for confidential protection and will be maintained as a nonpublic part of the Commission's file in this case. The procedure for usage of confidential materials during formal proceedings may be found at Section 7(8) of 807 KAR 5:001.

If the information becomes publically available or no longer warrants confidential treatment, Kentucky Utilities Company is required by Section 8(9)(a) of 807 KAR 5:001 to inform the Commission so that the information may be placed in the public record.

**Executive Director** 

kg/

cc: Parties of Record

KentuckyUnbridledSpirit.com



An Equal Opportunity Employer M/F/D

Steven L. Beshear Governor

Leonard K. Peters Secretary **Energy and Environment Cabinet** 



Commonwealth of Kentucky **Public Service Commission** 211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

David L. Armstrong Chairman

> James Gardner Vice-Chairman

John W. Clay Commissioner

October 20, 2008

Stoll Keenon Ogden, PLLC Attention: W. Duncan Crosby III 2000 PNC Plaza 500 West Jefferson Street Louisville, Kentucky 40202-2828

E.ON U.S. LLC Attention: Allyson K. Sturgeon 220 West Main Street Louisville, Kentucky 40202

Kentucky Utilities - Petition for Confidentiality received 9/12/08 Re:

PSC Reference - Case No. 2008-00285

### Dear Sir/Madam:

The Public Service Commission has received Kentucky Utilities' Petition for confidential treatment requesting to protect as confidential certain information contained in its response to questions 10(a) and 17 set out in Appendix A of the Commission's Order dated August 22, 2008. The information is described as 2 Weir Reports which concern coal suppliers' costs in complying with the "Miner Act" and coal bid analysis information.

Based upon a review of the information, I have determined that it is entitled to the protection requested on the grounds relied upon in the Petition and should be withheld from public inspection.

If the information becomes publicly available or no longer warrants confidential treatment, Kentucky Utilities is required by 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7(9)(a), to inform the Commission so that the information may be placed in the public record.

Executive Director

kg/

cc: Parties of Record

Kentuc

An Equal Opportunity Employer M/F/D

Steven L. Beshear Governor

Robert D. Vance, Secretary Environmental and Public **Protection Cabinet** 

Timothy J. LeDonne Commissioner Department of Public Protection



Commonwealth of Kentucky **Public Service Commission** 

211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

February 27, 2008

Mark David Goss Chairman

> John W. Clay Vice Chairman

Caroline Pitt Clark Commissioner

Hon. Kendrick R. Riggs Hon. W. Duncan Crosby III STOLL KEENON OGDEN, PLLC 2000 PNC Plaza, 500 W. Jefferson St. Louisville, Kentucky 40202-2838

Hon. Allyson K. Sturgeon E.ON U.S. LLC 220 West Main Street Louisville, Kentucky 40202

Kentucky Utilities Company's Petition for Confidentiality Re:

PSC Case No. 2007-00524

Gentlemen and Ms. Sturgeon:

The Public Service Commission has received Kentucky Utility Company's Petition for confidential treatment requesting to protect as confidential, certain information in its Response to Item 17 of the Commission's Order of January 23, 2008. This information is identified in the Petition as pertaining to coal bid analysis information.

Based upon a review of the information, I have determined that it is entitled to the protection requested on the grounds relied upon in the Petition and should be withheld from public inspection.

If the information becomes publicly available or no longer warrants confidential treatment, Kentucky Utilities Company is required by 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7(9)(a), to inform the Commission so that the information may be placed in the public record.

<del>Sinc</del>erely

Beth O'Donnell.

**Executive Director** 

kg/

cc: Parties of Record

An Equal Opportunity Employer M/F/D